

1 **FITZGERALD MONROE FLYNN PC**

JACK FITZGERALD (SBN 257370)

2 *jfitzgerald@fmfpc.com*

3 MELANIE PERSINGER (SBN 275423)

*mmonroe@fmfpc.com*

4 TREVOR M. FLYNN (SBN 253362)

*tflynn@fmfpc.com*

5 PETER GRAZUL (SBN 342735)

*pgrauzl@fmfpc.com*

6 2341 Jefferson Street, Suite 200

7 San Diego, CA 92110

Phone: (619) 215-1741

8 *Class Counsel*

11 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
12 **NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

13 RALPH MILAN and ELIZABETH ARNOLD on  
14 behalf of themselves, those similarly situated and the  
15 general public,

15 Plaintiffs,

16 v.

17 CLIF BAR & COMPANY,

18 Defendant.

Case No: 18-cv-02354-JD

**DECLARATION OF RALPH MILAN**

Judge: Hon. James Donato

Hearing: November 14, 2024, 10:00 a.m.

Location: Courtroom 11, 19th Floor

1 I, Ralph Milan, declare:

2 1. I am a Class Representative in this matter and make this declaration based on my own personal  
3 knowledge. I could and would competently testify to the facts stated herein if called to do so.

4 2. I have been working with my attorneys on this matter since approximately October 2017,  
5 when I first discussed the case, my purchases, and how I was deceived by the labels with them. At that time,  
6 and ever since, for almost seven years, I have been in periodic contact with my attorneys about the case.

7 3. In October 2017, I had a lengthy phone call with attorney Paul Joseph, and then in November  
8 2017, a number of shorter phone calls with Richelle Kemler, Mr. Joseph's associate. I estimate these calls  
9 collectively lasted about two hours.

10 4. I subsequently met with Mr. Joseph on November 20, 2017, in person, to discuss the case, my  
11 role as a Class Representative, and what my duties and responsibilities would be. We reviewed the Complaint  
12 together and I helped him fill in details. That in-person lunch meeting lasted about two hours.

13 5. Between November 2017 and April 2018, I worked with my attorneys, including Mr. Joseph  
14 and Jack Fitzgerald, to prepare the Complaint for filing and to give Clif notice of its violations. I estimate I  
15 spent about one hour looking at the Complaint and communicating with my counsel to provide any needed  
16 details.

17 6. From February to March 2020, I worked with my counsel to respond to discovery requests  
18 from Clif. These consisted of 25 interrogatories and 55 requests for production of documents. In May, July,  
19 and October 2020, I worked with my counsel to provide supplemental responses to Clif's interrogatories and  
20 requests for production. In total, I estimate I spent about five hours working on my discovery responses and  
21 searching for responsive documents.

22 7. On April 23, 2020, I was deposed in this matter, via Zoom. I spent approximately eight hours  
23 being deposed, including time spent after the deposition with my attorneys. Prior to the deposition, I worked  
24 with my counsel to prepare for my deposition, spending approximately three hours on that preparation.

25 8. There were several mediations and a settlement conference in this matter. Before each, I spoke  
26 with my attorneys and was expected to be available to participate when called upon to do so, including to  
27 evaluate any proposed settlements on behalf of the class. For each, I made myself available during the entirety

1 of the session and would frequently discuss, sometimes at length, offers and counteroffers with the attorneys.  
2 Collectively, I spent approximately three hours discussing settlement over the course of the various  
3 settlement sessions. Additionally, I was present for the entirety of the approximately two-and-one-half hour  
4 Zoom settlement conference on January 13, 2022.

5 9. I was prepared to travel from Santa Ana in Southern California to San Francisco to participate  
6 in, and testify at trial.

7 10. Throughout the many years I have spent as a named plaintiff and Class Representative in this  
8 case, I have numerous times consulted with, or been consulted by, my attorneys. Approximately once every  
9 three months, I would have contact with my counsel either by phone or email to get updates on the case,  
10 often times proactively reaching out to make sure I was staying fully informed. I have reviewed each filing  
11 that was relevant to me before it was filed. In addition to the specific matters detailed herein, given that I  
12 would regularly communicate with my counsel on the status of the case for over six years, I estimate I have  
13 spent eight hours working on miscellaneous case-related matters, reviewing filings, discussing the status of  
14 the case, and reviewing and signing the settlement agreement.

15 11. In sum, I believe I have dedicated approximately 34.5 hours participating in this case and  
16 fulfilling my duties as a Class Representative.

17 12. I understand that as Class Representative, I am representing other purchasers of the Clif Bar  
18 products at issue in this case. I understand that I have a fiduciary duty to the Class, and am obligated to make  
19 decisions in the best interest of the whole Class and all Class Members. I have reviewed the Settlement  
20 Agreement and believe the settlement is in the best interests of the class.

21 13. I have no separate agreements with Clif or my attorneys to receive any compensation relating  
22 to this matter, other than what the Court may grant.

23 I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct to the best of my knowledge.  
24 Executed on September 6, 2024, in Santa Ana, California.

25 By:  Signed by:  
26 50241A72E40A...  
27 Ralph Milan